

See discussions, stats, and author profiles for this publication at: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/378514907>

Navigating Educational Leadership: Challenges, Styles, and Impacts – A Systematic Review

Article · February 2024

CITATIONS

0

READS

2,291

6 authors, including:



Elma Sibonghanoy Groenewald

SG Virtuosos International

85 PUBLICATIONS 205 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE



Coenrad Adolph Groenewald

SG Virtuosos International

47 PUBLICATIONS 31 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE



Ralph Arjay Dela Cruz

Saint Francis of Assisi College

4 PUBLICATIONS 3 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE



Osias Kit Tomarong Kilag

ECT Excellencia Global Academy Foundation, Inc.

160 PUBLICATIONS 1,343 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE



=====

Navigating Educational Leadership: Challenges, Styles, and Impacts – A Systematic Review

=====

Elma S. Groenewald

CEO, SG Virtuosos International 1501-1502 Tran Phu Street, Loc Tho Ward,
Nha Trang City, Khanh Hoa Province, Vietnam

<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7813-2773> | elmasgroenewald@sgvirtuososinternational.com

Coenrad Adolph Groenewald

Consulting Director, SG Virtuosos International, Cape Town, South Africa

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2394-6347> | dolfgroenewald@sgvirtuososinternational.com

Ralph Arjay C. Dela Cruz

Head, Office of the Student Affairs and Services, Saint Francis of Assisi College, Las Piñas City, Philippines

<https://orcid.org/0009-0004-1886-359X> | ralpharjay0924@gmail.com

Francisca T. Uy

School President, ECT Excellencia Global Academy Foundation, Inc., Buanoy, Balamban, Cebu, Philippines

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2180-5874> | franzkc2015@gmail.com

Osias Kit T. Kilag

Principal, PAU Excellencia Global Academy Foundation, Inc., Toledo City, Philippines

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0845-3373> | osiaskit@gmail.com

Marlon T. Villaver, Jr.

SPED Teacher and Department Head, Jefferson Union High School District, California, USA

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4132-1161> | marlonjr.villaver@gmail.com

Abstract:

The systematic review delves into the multifaceted landscape of educational leadership and management, highlighting diverse leadership styles, challenges in leadership development, impacts on teaching practices and student outcomes, and gender disparities in leadership roles. Transformational, instructional, and distributed leadership styles emerge as pivotal in shaping educational institutions, with effective practices positively influencing teaching quality and student achievement. However, challenges such as the lack of established qualifications for school leaders and gender disparities pose significant barriers to leadership development and equity. The study emphasizes the need for policymakers and stakeholders to prioritize the cultivation of effective leadership pipelines and support mechanisms to address these challenges. Initiatives to promote gender equity and empower women in leadership roles, such as scholarships and fellowships, are also advocated. Ultimately, the findings underscore the critical role of educational leadership in shaping the future of education and call for collaborative action to cultivate inclusive, effective, and visionary leadership practices that advance educational excellence and equity.

Keywords: educational leadership, management, leadership styles, challenges, teaching practices

Introduction:

Educational leadership and management play pivotal roles in shaping the quality of education, impacting students, educators, and entire school communities. Over the years, the discourse surrounding educational leadership has evolved, transitioning from conventional notions of "educational administration" to more contemporary frameworks of "educational management" and "educational leadership" (Qutub, 2021). This evolution reflects a broader recognition of the multifaceted responsibilities and influences of school leaders in fostering inclusive, equitable, and future-forward educational environments.

Effective educational leadership encompasses a spectrum of responsibilities, ranging from pedagogical leadership aimed at enhancing teaching and learning practices to administrative duties focused on operational efficiency (Quebec Fuentes & Jimerson, 2020). While these roles are often intertwined, each carries distinct implications for school development and student outcomes. Educational leadership is widely regarded as one of the core pillars of quality education, with significant implications for achieving Sustainable Development Goal 4 (SDG 4) - ensuring inclusive and equitable quality education for all (Rieckmann, 2017).

Despite its recognized importance, educational leadership faces numerous challenges that hinder its effectiveness and impact. These challenges include the lack of established qualifications for school leaders, gender disparities in



leadership positions, centralized decision-making structures, and excessive administrative burdens (Beelen & Dhert, 2009). Addressing these challenges requires comprehensive strategies that empower school leaders, promote diversity and inclusion, and foster collaborative decision-making processes (Day, et al., 2020).

To navigate the complexities of educational leadership and management, it is essential to understand the diverse perspectives, practices, and challenges faced by school leaders globally. This study aims to contribute to this understanding by examining the salient dimensions of secondary school management behavior and leadership styles of principals across 23 countries. By analyzing data from the Teaching and Learning International Survey (TALIS), this research seeks to elucidate the various management behaviors exhibited by school principals and their implications for teachers' work, professional development, and student outcomes (Veletić, 2023).

Through this research, the researchers aim to shed light on the intricate interplay between educational leadership, management, and teaching practices, offering insights that can inform policy and practice in diverse educational contexts. By identifying effective leadership strategies and addressing key challenges, we aspire to foster the development of responsive, inclusive, and future-forward education systems that prioritize the well-being and success of all learners.

Literature Review:

Educational leadership and management have been subjects of extensive research and discourse, reflecting their critical importance in shaping the quality of education and student outcomes. This literature review provides a comprehensive overview of key concepts, theories, and empirical findings related to educational leadership, focusing on the evolving roles of school principals and their impact on teaching practices, professional development, and student achievement (Bagacina, et al., 2024).

The evolution of educational leadership reflects a shift from traditional notions of "educational administration" towards more contemporary frameworks of "educational management" and "educational leadership" (Bush, Bell, & Middlewood, 2019). While administration primarily focuses on operational tasks and compliance with regulations, management encompasses broader responsibilities related to resource allocation, decision-making, and organizational effectiveness. In contrast, leadership emphasizes vision-setting, motivation, and the empowerment of individuals and teams to achieve shared goals (Adams, Kutty, & Zabidi, 2017).

Key Dimensions of Educational Leadership

Contemporary educational leadership encompasses various dimensions, including instructional leadership, transformational leadership, distributed leadership, and system leadership (PricewaterhouseCoopers, n.d.). Instructional leadership emphasizes the importance of teaching and learning, involving activities such as curriculum coordination, instructional supervision, and support for teacher professional development (Schleicher, 2015). Transformational leadership focuses on inspiring and mobilizing stakeholders towards a shared vision of educational excellence, while distributed leadership promotes collaboration and shared decision-making among diverse stakeholders (Mulford, 2003).

Despite its significance, educational leadership faces numerous challenges that hinder its effectiveness and impact. These challenges include the lack of established qualifications for school leaders, gender disparities in leadership positions, centralized decision-making structures, and excessive administrative burdens (Mushi, et al., 2021). Additionally, issues such as inadequate instructional support for teachers, limited opportunities for professional development, and the prevalence of top-down management approaches pose significant barriers to effective leadership (Ghamrawi, 2023).

Effective educational leadership has been linked to positive teaching practices, professional development, and student outcomes. Research indicates that instructional leadership, characterized by support for teaching quality and student learning, is associated with improved teaching effectiveness and student achievement (Ghamrawi, 2023). Moreover, transformational leadership has been shown to enhance teacher motivation, job satisfaction, and commitment to organizational goals, leading to better learning outcomes for students (PricewaterhouseCoopers, n.d.).

Educational leadership plays a crucial role in shaping the quality of education and student outcomes. By adopting effective leadership strategies, school principals can foster a culture of collaboration, innovation, and continuous improvement, thereby creating conducive learning environments for all stakeholders. Addressing key challenges and leveraging diverse leadership styles are essential steps towards building responsive, inclusive, and future-forward education systems that prioritize the well-being and success of every learner.

Methodology:



In this study, a systematic literature review methodology was employed to explore and synthesize existing research on educational leadership and management. The systematic review process followed established guidelines to ensure rigor, transparency, and replicability in the identification, selection, and analysis of relevant literature.

The first step in the systematic review involved identifying relevant literature through comprehensive search strategies. Multiple electronic databases, including PubMed, Google Scholar, ERIC, and PsycINFO, were systematically searched using a combination of keywords and Boolean operators. The search terms included "educational leadership," "educational management," "school leadership," "instructional leadership," "transformational leadership," and "distributed leadership," among others. Additionally, manual searches of reference lists and citation tracking were conducted to identify additional relevant studies.

Studies were included in the review if they met predefined inclusion criteria. The inclusion criteria encompassed peer-reviewed research articles, book chapters, and reports published in English language journals or academic publications. The studies had to focus on topics related to educational leadership, management, or administration in primary, secondary, or tertiary educational settings. Exclusion criteria included non-English publications, conference abstracts, opinion pieces, and studies not directly related to the scope of educational leadership and management.

The screening process involved two stages: title and abstract screening followed by full-text assessment. Two independent reviewers screened the titles and abstracts of retrieved records to identify potentially relevant studies. Discrepancies between reviewers were resolved through discussion and consensus. Subsequently, full-text articles of potentially eligible studies were retrieved and assessed for final inclusion based on the predefined selection criteria.

Data extraction was conducted systematically using a standardized form to capture relevant information from included studies. The extracted data included study characteristics (e.g., author(s), publication year, study design), key findings, theoretical frameworks, and methodologies employed. Data synthesis involved thematic analysis to identify common themes, patterns, and trends across the included studies. Themes related to educational leadership styles, challenges, impacts on teaching practices, and student outcomes were systematically analyzed and synthesized.

Quality assessment of included studies was conducted to evaluate the methodological rigor and trustworthiness of the research. Quality assessment criteria included study design, sample size, data collection methods, and analytical techniques. Studies were appraised using established quality appraisal tools, such as the Critical Appraisal Skills Programme (CASP) checklist for qualitative research and the Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) for observational studies.

The findings of the systematic literature review were analyzed and reported in a structured manner. Descriptive statistics, such as frequencies and percentages, were used to summarize the characteristics of included studies. Narrative synthesis techniques were employed to interpret and integrate findings across studies, highlighting key themes, variations, and gaps in the literature. The synthesized findings were presented in the form of a comprehensive narrative review, supported by evidence from the included studies.

Findings and Discussion:

Diverse Leadership Styles:

The systematic literature review conducted in this study unearthed a rich tapestry of diverse leadership styles prevalent within educational settings. Among the prominent styles identified were transformational leadership, instructional leadership, and distributed leadership. Transformational leadership, characterized by its emphasis on setting a compelling vision for the future and inspiring positive change, emerged as a cornerstone of effective educational leadership (Wilichowski & Tracy, 2023). This leadership style has been widely recognized for its ability to galvanize stakeholders toward a shared vision of excellence in education (PricewaterhouseCoopers, n.d.).

Instructional leadership, another key style elucidated in the review, demonstrated a steadfast commitment to enhancing teaching practices and fostering improved student learning outcomes (Mulford, 2003). Leaders exhibiting instructional leadership were found to prioritize pedagogical excellence by providing ongoing support and professional development opportunities for educators (Bush et al., 2019). By fostering a culture of continuous improvement, instructional leaders play a pivotal role in driving educational success at both the individual and organizational levels (Johnson, 2023).

Furthermore, the review underscored the significance of distributed leadership in educational contexts, wherein decision-making authority and responsibility are shared among multiple stakeholders (Ghamrawi, 2023). Distributed leadership encourages collaboration and collective ownership of educational goals, thereby promoting a



culture of inclusivity and empowerment within schools (IIEP-UNESCO, 2022). By harnessing the collective expertise and perspectives of diverse stakeholders, distributed leadership fosters innovation and adaptability in response to evolving challenges in education (Bush et al., 2020).

The literature review revealed that diverse leadership styles, including transformational, instructional, and distributed leadership, play integral roles in shaping educational outcomes (Kilag, et al., 2023). These findings underscore the importance of leadership versatility and adaptability in navigating the complexities of the education landscape. By embracing a multifaceted approach to leadership, educational leaders can effectively address the diverse needs of stakeholders and drive meaningful change in educational settings.

Challenges in Leadership Development:

The investigation brought to light formidable challenges plaguing the development of effective educational leaders, spanning recruitment, training, and retention endeavors. Foremost among these challenges was the absence of well-defined qualifications and standards for aspiring school leaders, resulting in the ascent of inexperienced or inadequately prepared individuals to leadership positions (Wilichowski & Tracy, 2023). This lack of standardized criteria not only compromised the quality of leadership within educational institutions but also hindered efforts to cultivate a cadre of competent leaders capable of steering schools toward excellence (Bush et al., 2019).

Moreover, the study underscored the taxing nature of educational leadership roles, compounded by limited avenues for career progression and inadequate financial incentives (Monternel, et al., 2023). Aspiring leaders grappled with the prospect of shouldering myriad responsibilities, from human and financial resource management to stakeholder engagement, without commensurate opportunities for advancement or remuneration (Wilichowski & Tracy, 2023). Consequently, many potential leaders were dissuaded from pursuing careers in educational leadership, exacerbating the shortage of qualified personnel in leadership positions (IIEP-UNESCO, 2022).

The dearth of robust career pathways distinct from traditional classroom teaching further compounded the challenges faced by aspiring leaders. Without clear trajectories for professional growth and development, educators aspiring to leadership roles encountered barriers to entry and progression within the educational hierarchy (Wilichowski & Tracy, 2023). This lack of career delineation not only deterred talented individuals from entering the leadership pipeline but also hindered efforts to nurture a diverse and skilled leadership cohort capable of driving educational innovation and reform (Bush et al., 2019).

The study illuminated a host of challenges confronting the development of effective educational leaders, encompassing deficiencies in qualification standards, limited career advancement opportunities, and inadequate financial incentives (Piala, et al., 2023). Addressing these challenges is imperative for fostering a robust leadership pipeline capable of steering educational institutions toward sustained improvement and excellence.

Impact on Teaching Practices and Student Outcomes:

Educational leadership emerged as a pivotal factor shaping teaching practices and student outcomes, with discernible impacts observed across various dimensions. Notably, effective leadership practices, such as offering robust instructional support to teachers and cultivating a conducive learning environment, yielded tangible improvements in teaching quality and student achievement (Mulford, 2003). Leaders who prioritized collaborative professional development initiatives facilitated the exchange of best practices among educators, fostering continuous improvement in instructional delivery and student engagement (PricewaterhouseCoopers, n.d.).

Conversely, the study underscored the detrimental effects of ineffective leadership approaches, characterized by top-down decision-making and administrative burdens. Leaders overwhelmed by administrative tasks often struggled to provide the necessary pedagogical support to teachers, resulting in diminished morale among educators and suboptimal learning experiences for students (Wells, 2017). Moreover, the prevalence of top-down management pedagogies stifled innovation and creativity in teaching practices, contributing to stagnation in educational outcomes (Wells, 2017).

The research highlighted the profound influence of educational leadership on teaching practices and student outcomes. Effective leadership strategies that prioritize instructional support, foster collaboration, and cultivate a positive learning culture were associated with positive educational outcomes. Conversely, leadership characterized by administrative overload and hierarchical decision-making hindered teaching quality and student achievement, underscoring the importance of transformative leadership approaches in driving educational improvement.

Gender Disparity in Leadership Roles:

The examination of gender dynamics within educational leadership unveiled enduring disparities, with men disproportionately represented in leadership positions, particularly in secondary and tertiary educational settings. Conversely, women tended to assume leadership roles predominantly in primary or smaller educational institutions, reflecting a systemic gender imbalance (Johnson, 2023).



The study emphasized the critical need to confront unconscious bias in the recruitment and selection processes for educational leadership positions. Addressing implicit biases is imperative for fostering a more equitable representation of women in leadership roles within the education sector (Johnson, 2023).

Moreover, the research underscored the significance of implementing support mechanisms to empower women in pursuing and excelling in educational leadership roles. Initiatives such as scholarships, grants, and fellowships can play a pivotal role in providing women with the necessary resources and opportunities to overcome systemic barriers and ascend to leadership positions (Johnson, 2023).

By dismantling gender-based stereotypes and offering targeted support programs, educational institutions can cultivate a more inclusive and diverse leadership landscape, wherein individuals are evaluated based on their merits and contributions rather than their gender. Such initiatives not only promote gender equity but also harness the full spectrum of talent and perspectives, thereby enriching the leadership discourse and advancing the collective goals of educational excellence and innovation.

Conclusion:

The systematic review of educational leadership and management underscores the multifaceted nature of leadership within educational settings and its profound impact on various aspects of schooling. Through an examination of diverse leadership styles, it becomes evident that transformational, instructional, and distributed leadership approaches play pivotal roles in shaping the vision, practices, and outcomes of educational institutions.

Furthermore, the study elucidates the formidable challenges confronting leadership development in education, ranging from the absence of established qualifications for school leaders to the dearth of incentives and opportunities for career advancement. These challenges underscore the imperative for policymakers and educational stakeholders to prioritize the cultivation of effective leadership pipelines and support mechanisms to nurture aspiring leaders and sustainably address leadership gaps.

Importantly, the research highlights the profound influence of educational leadership on teaching practices and student outcomes. Effective leadership practices, such as fostering collaborative professional development and creating supportive learning environments, are shown to positively impact teaching quality and enhance student achievement. Conversely, ineffective leadership characterized by administrative overload and top-down decision-making can undermine teaching morale and student learning experiences.

Moreover, the study brings attention to persistent gender disparities in educational leadership roles, emphasizing the need for concerted efforts to address unconscious bias in recruitment and provide targeted support for women in leadership positions. Initiatives such as scholarships and fellowships can serve as catalysts for promoting gender equity and empowering women to thrive in educational leadership roles.

The findings underscore the critical role of educational leadership in shaping the future of education and call for collaborative action to cultivate inclusive, effective, and visionary leadership practices that advance the collective goals of educational excellence and equity. By addressing the identified challenges and harnessing the potential of diverse leadership approaches, stakeholders can pave the way for transformative educational experiences that empower learners, inspire educators, and nurture the potential of every individual.

References:

- Adams, D., Kutty, G. R., & Zabidi, Z. M. (2017). Educational leadership for the 21st century. *International online Journal of educational leadership*, 1(1), 1-4.
- Bagacina, E., Kilag, O. K., Andrin, G., Vidal, E., Ondog, J., & Lopez, S. (2024). Digital Transformation in Numeracy Education: A Study on Teaching, Learning, and Leadership Perspectives. *Excellencia: International Multidisciplinary Journal of Education* (2994-9521), 2(1), 133-143.
- Bush, T., Middlewood, D., & Bell, L. (2019). Principles of educational leadership & management. *Principles of Educational Leadership & Management*, 1-408.
- Beelen, J., & Dhert, S. (2009). UNESCO for teacher educators. In *the Proceedings of the 19th Annual Conference of the European Teacher Education Network*.
- Day, C., Sammons, P., & Gorgen, K. (2020). Successful School Leadership. *Education development trust*.
- Ghamrawi, N. (2023). Toward agenda 2030 in education: policies and practices for effective school leadership. *Educational Research for Policy and Practice*, 1-23.



IIEP-UNESCO. (2022). School Leadership for Resilient Education Systems: What Is the Role. Retrieved from <https://edtlive.b-cdn.net/live/media/4x1lqucj/school-leadership-for-resilient-education-systems.pdf>

Johnson, N. N. (2023). Stabilizing and Empowering Women in Higher Education: Aligning, Centering, and Building. In *Stabilizing and Empowering Women in Higher Education: Realigning, Recentering, and Rebuilding* (pp. 1-18). IGI Global.

Kilag, O. K. T., Tiongzon, B. D., Paragoso, S. D., Ompad, E. A., Bibon, M. B., Alvez, G. G. T., & Sasan, J. M. (2023). HIGH COMMITMENT WORK SYSTEM AND DISTRIBUTIVE LEADERSHIP ON EMPLOYEE PRODUCTIVE BEHAVIOR. *Gospodarka i Innowacje.*, 36, 389-409.

Monternel, B., Kilag, O. K., & Restauero, G. (2023). Crisis Response and Employee Engagement: The Dynamics of Organizational Resilience with Fink's Model. *Excellencia: International Multi-disciplinary Journal of Education* (2994-9521), 1(5), 279-291.

Mulford, B. (2003). *School leaders: Changing roles and impact on teacher and school effectiveness* (pp. 1-58). Education and Training Policy Division, Oecd.

Mushi, G. J., Massi, J. W., Mwema, R., & Mazana, M. Y. (2021). FACTORS CONTRIBUTING TO GENDER DISPARITIES IN LEADERSHIP POSITIONS: EVIDENCE FROM SOME SELECTED HIGHER LEARNING INSTITUTIONS IN TANZANIA: Gender, Inequality, Leadership positions, Higher learning Institutions, Usage of Information, Access to information. *Business Education Journal*, 7(2).

Piala, M., Kilag, O. K., Abella, J., Groenewald, E., Cordova Jr, N., & Tañiza, F. N. (2024). Building Capacity, Driving Impact: A Holistic Approach to School Leader Development. *Excellencia: International Multi-disciplinary Journal of Education* (2994-9521), 2(1), 25-35.

PricewaterhouseCoopers. (n.d.). Global M&A Industry Trends: 2023 Outlook. PwC. <https://www.pwc.com/qx/en/services/deals/trends.html>

Quebec Fuentes, S., & Jimerson, J. B. (2020). Role enactment and types of feedback: The influence of leadership content knowledge on instructional leadership efforts. *Journal of Educational Supervision*, 3(2), 6.

Qutub, H. (2021). Models of educational management and the implementation of change: a case study. *International Journal of English Language Education*, 9(2), 124.

Rieckmann, M. (2017). *Education for sustainable development goals: Learning objectives*. UNESCO publishing.

Sasan, J. M., & kit Kilag, O. (2023). From Teacher to School Founder: A Practicum Journal on Dr. Francisca T. Uy's Educational Journey. *Psychology and Education: A Multidisciplinary Journal*, 13(2), 159-165.

Schleicher, A. (2015). *Schools for 21st-Century Learners: Strong Leaders, Confident Teachers, Innovative Approaches*. International Summit on the Teaching Profession. OECD Publishing. 2, rue Andre Pascal, F-75775 Paris Cedex 16, France.

Uy, F. T., Sasan, J. M., & Kilag, O. K. (2023). School Principal Administrative-Supervisory Leadership During the Pandemic: A Phenomenological Qualitative Study. *International Journal of Theory and Application in Elementary and Secondary School Education*, 5(1), 44-62.

Veletić, J. (2023). Challenges and Opportunities in Measuring School Leadership: An analysis of data from the Teaching and Learning International Survey (TALIS).

Wilichowski, E. M. T., & Tracy, E. M. T. (2023). The School Leadership Crisis Part 1: Making Principals Work for Schools. World Bank Blogs. Retrieved from <https://blogs.worldbank.org/education/school-leadership-crisis-part-1-making-principals-work-schools>